Appendix A: Definitions and Approach to Measuring Strong, Autonomous Feminist Movements

Mala Htun and S. Laurel Weldon. 2012. *The Civic Origins of Progressive Policy Change:* Combating Violence against Women in Global Perspective" APSR. 106 (3) August 2012.

<u>Women's Movement:</u> A women's movement is a social movement comprised primarily of women and whose leadership is primarily composed of women. A women's movement may be a conservative movement, a labor movement or any other movement of women. The key is that women are organized as women. They may have feminist or non-feminist ends.

<u>Feminist Movement:</u> Most feminist movements are women's movements. Conceptually it is possible for men's movements to be feminist (i.e. white ribbon campaign, men against violence against women, etc). Feminist movement refers to a collective behavior coordinated by the idea of improving women's status (and/or the status of some sub-group of women), and/or promoting equality, and/or ending patriarchy. Feminist movements are social change movements that identify the status quo as being disadvantageous to women compared to men. An analytic definition of feminism should be descriptively accurate, and may not necessarily capture our normative ideal of feminism (i.e. many feminist movements have been racist, although our ideal of feminism may include anti-racism) (cf. Beckwith 2000; Stetson and Mazur 2010). Such movements may or may not refer to themselves as feminist, especially since the context may not be an English-language context.

Existence of movements: The existence of women's movements and feminist movements can be studied cross-nationally based on a coding of historical and other narrative accounts of the women's movement in each country. Other documents and materials (directories of organizations, web-based materials, human rights reports) may also be used. Where accounts distinguish between the women's movement and the feminist movement, or second wave feminism, starting in the last half of the 20th century, the latter is coded as the beginning of the feminist movement. In most cases, a number of historical accounts are used to date the beginning of the women's liberation movement and to assess its strength comparatively. There tend to be few disputes among country experts about whether there is a women's movement and when it began, making coding relatively easy. A country which does not have a women's movement is coded zero, while those countries where a women's movement exists receive a "1".

We can study whether women's movements exist by asking whether there are reports or other evidence of any of the examples of social movement activity for particular years. We can determine whether these activities are feminist movement activities by asking whether the ideas and motivations they express concord with the goals of advancing women, improving women's status, advancing sex equality, or undermining patriarchy or male domination. We can determine whether they are also women's movements by asking whether the spokespeople, key activists, and supporters are women.

<u>Autonomy</u>: An autonomous feminist movement is a form of women's mobilization that is devoted to promoting women's status and well-being independently of political parties and other associations that do not have the status of women as their main concern.¹ For example, if the only women's organizations are women's wings or caucuses within the existing political parties, the women's movement is not autonomous. "Autonomous organizations...are characterized by *independent* actions, where women organize on the basis of self-activity, set their own goals, and decide their own forms of organization and struggle" (Molyneux, 1998). These organizations must be self-governing, and recognize no superior authority, nor be subject to the governance of other political agencies.

Women's movements can be coded as *autonomous* if they have an organizational base outside political parties, unions, and other political institutions. They must also be independent of organizations that do not make the condition of women their primary concern. Autonomous women's and feminist organizations are not subsidiaries, auxiliaries or wings of larger, mixed-sex organizations. Data on organizations can be taken from narrative accounts in journal articles and books, activist websites, media reports and encyclopedias of women's organizations (e.g. Barrett, 1993). Movements judged to be autonomous are coded "1" while those that are not autonomous are coded as "0".

In order to determine whether women's movements are autonomous, we ask about the organizational basis and origin for movement activities. Do they originate outside of non-feminist political parties and bureaucracies? (Autonomous.) Do all the ideas and initiatives come from the women's wing of the social democratic party or state women's commission? (Not autonomous.) Are there any activists located outside government? (Autonomous.) Are all the activists members of the government commission on women, or of the ruling party, or the family of the ruling party? (Not autonomous.) Again, it is not necessary that all feminist organizations are located outside government to be coded as autonomous: All that is required is that some part of the movement is autonomous so that there is some organizational autonomy to the women's movement.

Strength:

Women's movements also vary in terms of how strong or influential they are. Movements might be autonomous or independent but have little impact on the attitudes or awareness of those outside the active group or groups. Strong women's movements can command public support and attention, while weaker movements have trouble convincing the media and others that their positions and opinions are important for public discussion. Given what we know about democratic policymaking, it seems likely that strong women's movements will influence policy outcomes more than weak ones. But note that strong movements do not always influence policy outcomes (see Table 1 below).²

¹This sense of "autonomy" incorporates both independent and associational forms of women's movements as described by Molyneux (1998, 70).

 $^{^2}$ This is important because it shows that women's movement strength is logically separable from policy influence, thus avoiding what would otherwise be a tautological claim: that women's movements influence policymaking when they are influential in policymaking. Instead, we are arguing that when women's movement pronouncements and actions command public attention, they are more likely to

Movements can be coded as strong if they are described in narrative accounts as strong, influential, powerful, mobilizing widespread public support, and the like. Narrative accounts of women's movements often explicitly assess the strength of women's movements over time and/or relative to other countries. We never code a women's movement as strong simply because it appears to have influenced policies, or because someone, even a scholar, says it does. We are using general assessments of strength or influence of the women's movement on public opinion, mass attitudes, public discussions etc. Strength can also be assessed through an examination of the number and membership of women's organizations and the degree of support for those women's organizations. A large number of organizations, or a few well-supported and highly visible organizations generally indicate women's movements strength. Care must be taken, however, in contexts where the state has a tight control over civil society in general or women's organizations in particular. A large number of state controlled associations (state funded does not necessarily mean state controlled) may merely reflect the state's strength in marketing political issues to women. This data on organizations can be drawn from narrative accounts as well as encyclopedias of women's organizations.

Strength can also be indicated by massive protests and by a strong media presence. Reports of protests and media presence can be found in electronic searches of print and other media using Lexis-Nexis and other similar sources. Reports that elected or appointed politicians meet regularly to consult self-appointed women's movement leaders/activists also indicate a recognition that gaining support from a powerful social movement is necessary. As noted, evidence of widespread support for women's movements will be available in some cases in survey data, such as the World Values Survey. Movements that are moderately strong were scored 1, and movements that were very strong were scored 2. This was especially useful when the data indicated that strength dramatically increased or decreased, as we were able to capture this change.

These data are combined to construct a narrative of the development, strength, and autonomy of the women's movement. We do not use a single formula to calculate strength, but rather will look at different combinations of these various data sources for each country, weighing country and region-specific expert opinion most heavily, to arrive at a qualitatively-based assessment of strength.

Appendix Table 1: Strong Autonomous Movements and VAW Index

Country	Year	Women's Movement Existence	Feminist Women's Movement	Strength of Feminist Women's Movement	Autonomous Feminist Movement	VAW Index
Algeria	1975	1	0	0	0	0

have an influence on policymaking because public opinion and attitudes force politicians to pay attention to them. Of course, sometimes policymakers are unable or unwilling to translate these pressures into policies. As a result, we can conceptually distinguish between women's movement strength and policy outcomes affecting women.

Algeria	1985	1	1	1	0	0
Algeria	1995	1	1	1	0	0
Algeria	2005	1	1	2	0	3
Argentina	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Argentina	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Argentina	1995	1	1	1	1	7
Argentina	2005	1	1	2	1	8
Australia	1975	1	1	1	1	2
Australia	1985	1	1	1	1	3
Australia	1995	1	1	1	1	9
Australia	2005	1	1	1	1	10
Austria	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Austria	1985	1	1	0	0	2
Austria	1995	1	1	0	0	4
Austria	2005	1	1	1	1	9
Bangladesh	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Bangladesh	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Bangladesh	1995	1	1	1	1	2
Bangladesh	2005	1	1	2	1	6
Belgium	1975	1	1	1	1	1
Belgium	1985	1	1	1	1	2
Belgium	1995	1	1	1	1	3
Belgium	2005	1	1	1	1	8
Botswana	1975	1	1	0	1	1
Botswana	1985	1	1	0	1	1
Botswana	1995	1	1	1	1	1
Botswana	2005	1	1	1	1	5
Brazil	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Brazil	1985	1	1	2	1	2
Brazil	1995	1	1	2	1	7
Brazil	2005	1	1	2	1	8
Bulgaria	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Bulgaria	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Bulgaria	1995	1	1	0	0	0
Bulgaria	2005	1	1	0	1	0
Canada	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Canada	1985	1	1	2	1	5

Canada	1995	1	1	2	1	10
Canada	2005	1	1	2	1	10
Chile	1975	1	0	0	1	0
Chile	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Chile	1995	1	1	0	0	6
Chile	2005	1	1	0	0	7
China	1975	0	0	0	0	0
China	1985	1	0	0	0	0
China	1995	1	1	0	0	2
China	2005	1	1	0	0	2
Colombia	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Colombia	1985	1	1	0	1	1
Colombia	1995	1	1	1	1	5
Colombia	2005	1	1	0	1	6
Costa Rica	1975	1	1	0	1	2
Costa Rica	1985	1	1	1	1	2
Costa Rica	1995	1	1	2	1	7
Costa Rica	2005	1	1	2	1	8
Croatia	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Croatia	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Croatia	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Croatia	2005	1	1	0	1	5
Cuba	1975	1	1	1	0	1
Cuba	1985	1	1	1	0	1
Cuba	1995	1	1	1	0	1
Cuba	2005	1	1	1	0	2
Czech Republic	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Czech Republic	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Czech Republic	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Czech Republic	2005	1	1	0	1	3
Denmark	1975	1	1	2	1	0
Denmark	1985	1	1	2	0	0
Denmark	1995	1	1	1	0	1

Denmark	2005	1	1	0	0	9
Egypt	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Egypt	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Egypt	1995	1	1	1	0	0
Egypt	2005	1	1	1	0	2
Estonia	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Estonia	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Estonia	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Estonia	2005	1	1	0	1	1
Finland	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Finland	1985	1	1	0	0	1
Finland	1995	1	1	1	0	4
Finland	2005	1	1	1	0	7
France	1975	1	1	2	1	0
France	1985	1	1	1	1	3
France	1995	1	1	1	1	5
France	2005	1	1	1	1	8
Germany	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Germany	1985	1	1	0	1	2
Germany	1995	1	1	0	1	7
Germany	2005	1	1	0	1	8
Greece	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Greece	1985	1	1	1	0	0
Greece	1995	1	1	2	0	1
Greece	2005	1	1	2	1	6
Hungary	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Hungary	1985	1	0	0	1	0
Hungary	1995	1	1	0	1	1
Hungary	2005	1	1	0	1	2
Iceland	1975	1	1	2	1	0
Iceland	1985	1	1	1	1	1
Iceland	1995	1	1	1	1	3
Iceland	2005	1	1	0	1	7
India	1975	1	1	0	0	0
India	1985	1	1	1	1	1
India	1995	1	1	1	1	5
India	2005	1	1	1	1	6

Indonesia	1975	1	0	0	0	0
Indonesia	1985	1	1	0	0	0
Indonesia	1995	1	1	0	0	0
Indonesia	2005	1	1	1	1	7
Iran	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Iran	1985	1	1	0	0	0
Iran	1995	1	1	0	0	0
Iran	2005	1	1	0	0	1
Iraq	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Iraq	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Iraq	1995	0	0	0	0	0
Iraq	2005	1	1	0	1	0
Ireland	1975	1	1	2	1	0
Ireland	1985	1	1	1	1	1
Ireland	1995	1	1	2	1	5
Ireland	2005	1	1	2	1	10
Israel	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Israel	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Israel	1995	1	1	1	1	2
Israel	2005	1	1	0	1	6
Italy	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Italy	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Italy	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Italy	2005	1	1	0	1	3
Ivory Coast	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Ivory Coast	1985	1	1	0	0	0
Ivory Coast	1995	1	1	0	1	2
Ivory Coast	2005	1	1	0	1	5
Japan	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Japan	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Japan	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Japan	2005	1	1	0	1	7
Jordan	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Jordan	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Jordan	1995	1	1	1	0	0
Jordan	2005	1	1	0	0	0
Kazakhstan	1975	0	0	0	0	0

Kazakhstan	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Kazakhstan	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Kazakhstan	2005	1	1	0	1	2
Kenya	1975	1	0	0	1	0
Kenya	1985	1	0	0	1	0
Kenya	1995	1	1	1	1	0
Kenya	2005	1	1	2	1	5
Lithuania	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Lithuania	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Lithuania	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Lithuania	2005	1	1	1	1	2
Malaysia	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Malaysia	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Malaysia	1995	1	1	2	1	2
Malaysia	2005	1	1	2	1	6
Mexico	1975	1	1	0	1	1
Mexico	1985	1	1	1	1	1
Mexico	1995	1	1	2	1	5
Mexico	2005	1	1	2	1	6
Morocco	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Morocco	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Morocco	1995	1	1	2	1	0
Morocco	2005	1	1	2	1	4
Netherlands	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Netherlands	1985	1	1	2	1	1
Netherlands	1995	1	1	2	1	3
Netherlands	2005	1	1	2	1	7
New Zealand	1975	1	1	2	1	0
New Zealand	1985	1	1	2	1	3
New Zealand	1995	1	1	2	1	5
New Zealand	2005	1	1	1	1	8
Nigeria	1975	1	0	0	0	0
Nigeria	1985	1	1	0	0	0
Nigeria	1995	1	1	0	0	0
Nigeria	2005	1	1	0	1	3
Norway	1975	1	1	2	1	0
Norway	1985	1	1	2	1	2

Norway	1995	1	1	2	1	7
Norway	2005	1	1	2	1	10
Pakistan	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Pakistan	1985	1	1	1	1	1
Pakistan	1995	1	1	0	1	1
Pakistan	2005	1	1	0	1	3
Peru	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Peru	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Peru	1995	1	1	0	1	6
Peru	2005	1	1	1	1	7
Poland	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Poland	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Poland	1995	1	1	1	1	0
Poland	2005	1	1	0	1	5
Portugal	1975	1	1	0	0	0
Portugal	1985	1	1	0	1	0
Portugal	1995	1	1	0	1	3
Portugal	2005	1	1	0	1	9
Romania	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Romania	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Romania	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Romania	2005	1	1	0	1	3
Russia	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Russia	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Russia	1995	1	1	1	1	0
Russia	2005	1	1	1	1	3
Saudi Arabia	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Saudi Arabia	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Saudi Arabia	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Saudi Arabia	2005	1	1	0	0	0
Slovak Republic	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Slovak Republic	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Slovak Republic	1995	1	1	0	1	0
Slovak	2005	1	1	1	1	2

Republic						
Slovenia	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Slovenia	1985	1	0	0	1	0
Slovenia	1995	1	1	0	1	3
Slovenia	2005	1	1	0	1	5
South Africa	1975	1	0	0	0	0
South Africa	1985	1	1	1	0	0
South Africa	1995	1	1	1	1	1
South Africa	2005	1	1	1	1	8
South Korea	1975	1	1	1	0	0
South Korea	1985	1	1	0	0	0
South Korea	1995	1	1	1	1	1
South Korea	2005	1	1	1	1	8
Spain	1975	1	1	1	0	0
Spain	1985	1	1	2	1	1
Spain	1995	1	1	1	1	4
Spain	2005	1	1	0	1	5
Sweden	1975	1	1	0	0	1
Sweden	1985	1	1	0	0	4
Sweden	1995	1	1	0	0	6
Sweden	2005	1	1	0	0	8
Switzerland	1975	1	1	1	1	0
Switzerland	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Switzerland	1995	1	1	2	1	3
Switzerland	2005	1	1	2	1	9
Taiwan	1975	1	1	0	1	0
Taiwan	1985	1	1	1	1	0
Taiwan	1995	1	1	2	1	1
Taiwan	2005	1	1	2	1	8
Tanzania	1975	0	0	0	0	0
Tanzania	1985	0	0	0	0	0
Tanzania	1995	1	1	1	1	1
Tanzania	2005	1	1	2	1	4
Thailand	1975	1	1	0	1	1
Thailand	1985	1	1	0	1	1
Thailand	1995	1	1	0	1	1
Thailand	2005	1	1	0	1	7

Turkey19751001Turkey19851101Turkey19951111Turkey20051111Turkey20051111Ukraine19750000Ukraine19850000Ukraine19951001Uhred19751121United19751121United19851121United19851121United19951121	0 1 6 0 0 0 1 1 0
Turkey20051111Ukraine19750000Ukraine19850000Ukraine19951001Ukraine20051101United19751121United19851121United19851121	6 0 0 0 1
Turkey20051111Ukraine19750000Ukraine19850000Ukraine19951001Ukraine20051101United Kingdom19751121United Kingdom19851121	0 0 0 1
Ukraine197500000Ukraine198500000Ukraine19951001Ukraine20051101United Kingdom19751121United Kingdom19851121United United19851121	0 0 1
Ukraine 1995 1 0 0 1 Ukraine 2005 1 1 0 1 United 1975 1 1 2 1 United 1975 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1	0 1
Ukraine 2005 1 1 0 1 United 1975 1 1 2 1 United 1975 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1	1
United Kingdom19751121United Kingdom19851121United United19951121	
Kingdom 1975 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1985 1 1 2 1 United 1995 1 1 2 1	0
Kingdom19831121United19951121	Ŭ
	3
Kingdom 1995 I I Z I	4
United Kingdom 2005 1 1 2 1	7
United States 1975 1 1 2 1	1
United States 1985 1 1 2 1	4
United States 1995 1 1 2 1	8
United States 2005 1 1 2 1	10
Uruguay 1975 1 1 0 1	0
Uruguay 1985 1 0 0 1	0
Uruguay 1995 1 1 1 0	4
Uruguay 2005 1 1 1 0	5
Venezuela 1975 1 1 0 0	0
Venezuela 1985 1 1 1 1 1	4
Venezuela 1995 1 1 0 0	4
Venezuela 2005 1 1 0 0	6
Vietnam 1975 1 1 1 0	
Vietnam 1985 1 1 1 0	0
Vietnam 1995 1 1 1 0	0 1
Vietnam 2005 1 1 1 0	0